

DAVID M. LOUIE

RUSSELL A. SUZUKI FIRST DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL

STATE OF HAWAII

DEPARTMENT OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL
Health & Human Services Division
465 South King STREET, ROOM 200
HONOLULU, HAWAII 96813-2913
(808) 587-3050
FAX: (808) 587-3077

October 19, 2011

Dr. Orly Taitz, Esq. 29839 Santa Margarita Pkwy, Ste. 100 Rancho Santa Margarita, CA 92688

Via U.S. Mail and Fax: (949) 766-7603

Re: <u>Dr. Orly Taitz, Esq. vs. Loretta Fuddy, et al.</u>; Civil No. 11-1-1731-08 RAN Circuit Court of the First Circuit, State of Hawaii

Dear Dr. Taitz:

Pursuant to Rule 23 of the Rules of the Circuit Courts of the State of Hawaii, I have prepared the Order Granting Defendants' Motion to Dismiss Petition for a Writ of Mandamus Request for Inspection of Records under United (sic) Information Practices Act Statute 92F, State of Hawaii filed August 10, 2011. I am enclosing the order with this letter for your review and approval as to form. If you have no objections, please sign the order as to form and return it to me by mail for submission to the court. If you do have objections, you should submit them in writing to me and the court pursuant to Rule 23. If I do not receive your response within 5 days of this request, pursuant to Rule 23, I will submit the order for the court's review.

Very truly yours,

Jill T. Nagamine

Deputy Attorney General

enclosure

DAVID M. LOUIE

2162

Attorney General, State of Hawai'i

HEIDI M. RIAN

3473

JILL T. NAGAMINE

3513

REBECCA E. QUINN

8663

Deputy Attorneys General

465 South King Street, Room 200

Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Telephone: (808) 587-3050

Facsimile: (808) 587-3077

Email: Jill.T.Nagamine@hawaii.gov

Attorneys for Loretta Fuddy

Director of Health, State of Hawaii and Dr. Alvin T. Onaka, State Registrar of the

Department of Health, State of Hawaii

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF THE FIRST CIRCUIT

STATE OF HAWAII

DR. ORLY TAITZ, ESQ.,

VS.

CIVIL NO. 11-1-1731-08 RAN

Plaintiff,

LORETTA FUDDY IN HER OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS DIRECTOR OF THE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, STATE OF HAWAII, DR. ALVIN T. ONAKA, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS THE REGISTRAR. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, STATE OF HAWAII,

HEARING

DATE:

October 12, 2011

UNDER UNITED (SIC) INFORMATION

ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO DISMISS PETITION FOR A WRIT OF MANDAMUS REQUEST FOR INSPECTION OF RECORDS

PRACTICES ACT STATUTE 92F, STATE OF

TIME:

8:30 a.m.

HAWAII FILED AUGUST 10, 2011

JUDGE:

Hon. Rhonda A. Nishimura

Defendants.

ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO DISMISS PETITION FOR A WRIT OF MANDAMUS REQUEST FOR INSPECTION OF RECORDS UNDER UNITED (SIC) INFORMATION PRACTICES ACT STATUTE 92F, STATE OF HAWAII FILED AUGUST 10, 2011

On August 10, 2011, Dr. Orly Taitz, Esq. ("Plaintiff") filed her Petition for a Writ of Mandamus Request for Inspection of Records under United (sic) Information Practices Act Statute 92F, State of Hawaii ("Petition") against Loretta Fuddy, in her official capacity as Director of the Department of Health State of Hawaii, and Dr. Alvin T. Onaka, in his official capacity as the Registrar, Department of Health State of Hawaii ("Defendants"). The Petition sought a Writ of Mandamus advising the Defendants that (1) the President has waived any claims of privacy in his long form birth certificate by making a public disclosure of the document, (2) section 338-18, Hawaii Revised Statutes (HRS), does not apply to the President's long form birth certificate and that Defendants erred in relying on that statute in refusing to allow Plaintiff to inspect the document, (3) Defendants are obligated to allow Plaintiff for her costs and fees.

On September 2, 2011, Defendants filed their Motion to Dismiss Petition for a Writ of Mandamus Request for Inspection of Records under United (sic) Information Practices Act Statute 92F, State of Hawaii filed August 10, 2011 ("Motion"). Plaintiff submitted an Opposition to Motion Petition for Writ of Mandamus on October 4, 2011, and Defendant's Memorandum in Reply to Plaintiff's Opposition to Motion to Dismiss Petition for Writ of Mandamus was filed October 7, 2011.

On October 12, 2012, at 8:30 a.m., the Motion came on for hearing before the Honorable Rhonda A. Nishimura. Plaintiff appeared Pro Se, and Jill T. Nagamine and Rebecca E. Quinn, Deputy Attorneys General, State of Hawaii, appeared on behalf of the Defendants.

The Court, having considered all pleadings filed herein, the memoranda both in support of and in opposition to the motion, the arguments of counsel and Plaintiff Pro Se, the applicable law, and the record and files in this case, hereby finds as follows:

- 1. Relief is not available to Plaintiff pursuant to a Writ of Mandamus.
- 2. Plaintiff wants this Court to consider her Petition as an agency appeal pursuant to chapter 91, HRS; her pleadings do not constitute an agency appeal, nor would an agency appeal be proper under the circumstances presented.
- 3. Going beyond Plaintiff's requests to treat this matter as an agency appeal, if the Court treats the Petition as a Complaint, there is still no basis upon which to grant Plaintiff the relief she seeks.

THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ADJUDGED, ORDERED, AND DECREED that:

- 1. Defendants' Motion to Dismiss Petition for a Writ of Mandamus Request for Inspection of Records under United (sic) Information Practices Act Statute 92F, State of Hawaii filed August 10, 2011 is granted.
 - 2. All of Plaintiff's claims against the Defendants are dismissed with prejudice.

 DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii,

HONORABLE RHONDA A. NISHIMURA JUDGE OF THE ABOVE-ENTITLED COURT

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

DR. ORLY TAITZ, ESQ. Plaintiff Pro Se